Title: America's Multiple Political Elements of an United Culture

By John Girdwood, Ph.D. Candidate, Wayne State University

AABSS Conference, Las Vegas, Nevada, February 2, 2016
Overview

• There is a *political power relationship* between “the people’s relations to government” in collaboration with “the government’s relations to the people.”

• This finding enables me to describe a few of the well-known *signals* that are illustrated as political patterns with respect to the core values originating from liberalism, authoritarianism, and republicanism.

• In my paper, I account for these *expressions of the American culture*:
  • Appendix A

• Discover more confidently how the *culture helps to explain changes in American politics*. 

Tocqueville observes four value systems or *mores*.

1. **Authoritarianism**: soft despotism that is based on paternalism.
   - The *government* is the shepherd of the people.

2. **Liberalism**: individual is able to advance in a free market according to an equal opportunity across the nation.
   - The market is protected by *representatives in government*.

3. **Republicanism**: enlightened self-interest and local political participation to advance equality, resources, efficacy, and a common good.
   - *The people* generate the public policy direction for the representatives in government.

4. **Biblical Thought** transcends American politics and keeps the other political elements of the culture “in check” without government.
   - *God Bless America.*
Majority opinion resulted in the deviant being outcast by a tyranny of the majority

- **Northern republican values** of self-government based on notions of equality did attempt to influence the slavery debate in the nation.

- **The Bible** was used in the North and South differently to protect the republican and authoritarian identities, respectively.

- “Slavery did not attack the American confederation directly, through interests, but indirectly, through **mores**” (Tocqueville, 1988, 376).

- There is a “continual emigration from the North to the South [which] singularly favors the fusion of all provincial characteristics into one national character. So the civilization of **the North appears destined to be the norm to which all the rest must one day conform**” (Tocqueville, p. 384-5).

- **Liberalism**: “Slavery not only prevents the white man from making their fortunes but even diverts them from wishing to do so” because there is no “**material prosperity**” under slavery (Tocqueville, p. 347-348).
Tocqueville’s Four Major Mores: Elements of American Political Culture

The Cultural Combination of American Mores: Distinct Elements
Background of Liberalism

• Louis Hartz, The Liberal Tradition in America (1955).
  • Opinions and Values of Americans (OVS) and Civil Liberties Studies surveys
  • Public opinion shows that “values of capitalism and democracy are the principle components of the American political culture” (12).
• Alan Ware, Political Parties and Party Systems ([1996] 2009).
  • “the Democratic and Republican parties in the United States...are examples of Liberal parties; both practice bourgeois, business-orientated politics typical of European Liberalism...” (Ware, [1996] 2009, 25).
  • “…President Franklin Roosevelt's ‘hijacking’ of the term ‘liberal’ to describe his New Deal programmes” of governmental intervention were not much different than the English liberalism at the time; however, “the move towards state interventionism marked a break with traditional Liberal values of strict laissez faire” capitalism (2009, 26, italics mine).
Background of **Authoritarianism**

Hetherington and Weiler *Authoritarianism and Polarization in American Politics* (2009)

- Those who score lowest in authoritarianism are, by far, the least supportive of limitations to civil liberties while those who score highest are the most willing to support them.

- The largest differences on media censorship in fighting the war on terrorism. Only 27 percent of those who score at the minimum of the authoritarianism scale think the media should not report on secret methods in fighting the war on terrorism. Nearly 80 percent of those who score at the maximum of the scale do.

- Table 8.1, there is a gap of 39, 33, 44, and 40 percentage points between the two groups on: Immigration is a threat to American economy; Immigrants should adopt American culture; Illegal immigrants are lawbreakers, plain and simple; and, Against path of citizenship for illegal immigrants, respectively.

- Americans do hold authoritarian values like *mores, regardless* if other Americans are holding steadfast to the liberal tradition and bristle at these *values*!
Background of Republicanism

• “republicanism” [Not Republican Party] is a **long-standing tradition** within the American culture as a core value system (Pocock 1975, Bellah 1985)

• The **founding and antebellum era** in American politics were most intense as expressions of the republican element—not the liberal element (Wood 2011, Maloy 2011).

• “the state governments worked vigorously to deal with the problems facing their citizens... the republican governments in the states became the **whole object of the Revolution itself**” (Shalhope 2004, 87).

• **Towns** were nested and “essentially republican; in order permanently to destroy the laws which form the basis of the republic, one would have to almost abolish all the laws at once” (Tocqueville, p. 397).

• During the founding, “Republicanism’s emphasis upon equality encouraged **ordinary, obscure men to challenge all manifestations of authority and eminence within society**” (Shalhope 2004, xii).

• Or as James Madison put it, **the greed for paper money by representatives in state legislatures were abusive and “so frequent and so flagrant as to alarm the most steadfast friends of Republicanism...”** (Wood 2011, 131).
Girdwood and Grynaviski (2014) resolutions passed by state legislatures were familiar to the Senate proceedings from the founding to the American Civil War.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
<th>1830</th>
<th>1840</th>
<th>1850</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Instruct</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Instruct</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Instruct</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Instruct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Interior</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>(20)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>(21)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>(33)</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(20)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>(25)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>(17)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(40)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>(25)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>(46)</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Interior</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(40)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>(30)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>(17)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td></td>
<td>NA</td>
<td></td>
<td>NA</td>
<td></td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>(100)</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>(100)</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>(100)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Instruction = 1. *In parentheses is the column percentages **Green is highest by comparison.
Andrew Jackson did observably expand the republican practice of instruction

- Andrew Jackson did use the republican commitment of instruction to achieve public policy goals (Eaton 1952; Hoffmann 1956; Dupre 1994; Jaenicke 1986; Brown 1980; Meek 1967; Esarey 1917).

- President Jackson worked with the people and state legislatures to increase the numbers of resolutions brought before the national congress, whereby, under Jackson, “The doctrine of legislative instruction developed virtually into a form of recall of senators, anticipating the Progressive Movement for the recall in the early twentieth century” (Eaton 1952, 317).

- The Jacksonian era provided Jackson with “an incentive to intervene in state politics and by using the patronage to secure the removal of his opponents in the Senate” (Eaton, 1952).

- Jackson’s opponent “Leigh realized that it would be expedient for him to resign since most Virginians believed in the right of instruction” (p. 315, italics mine).

- **President Jackson utilized his goodwill with the people to have the people participate as an extended arm of the presidency.**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POLITICAL LANGUAGE</th>
<th>Role of citizenry</th>
<th>Direction of Power</th>
<th>Type of Government</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberalism</td>
<td>Vote in Elections</td>
<td>↔</td>
<td>Representative Democracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Values capitalism on traditional and progressive terms</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authoritarianism</td>
<td>Obedience</td>
<td>←</td>
<td>Government of Top-down Hierarchy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Values paternalism</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Republicanism</td>
<td>Grassroots Efforts, Participatory Democracy</td>
<td>→</td>
<td>Elected officials under Self-government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Values efficacy, a common good, and non-domination</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion

• By establishing and agreeing on the definitions of each political language, social scientists should be able to:
  • establish habitual signals that each political element does produce over time to affect political debates and policy.

• Given the definitions of the political languages in the Key, researchers could gather a sample of political dialogue or policy about a narrowly defined topic and:
  • match each piece of the sample (a sentence describing a specific topic) according to one of the political elements.
    • Republicanism
    • Authoritarianism
    • Liberalism
Primary Conclusion

• American culture is explainable through the core values of republicanism, liberalism, and authoritarianism
• independent elements that contribute to an united culture
  • Picture 1.1 and KEY.
• These independent elements are Independent Variables
  • Each element has a unique, and disparate, power structure for American politics that do not cross paths—or be destroyed. A
• Thus, a multiple traditions approach should be more explanatory than only a focus on liberalism because the other elements might explain exactly what is at the root of the change we see in liberalism.
Abstract

During the past 80 years, many scholars have commented with great detail about the American political traditions of republicanism, liberalism, and authoritarianism; however, very few scholars have been able to analyze these traditions together as an empirically grounded analysis regarding a narrowly defined topic, if at all. In this paper, I update Tocqueville’s swath of *mores* (Picture 1.1) for a clear depiction of the American culture (KEY).

The literature and my research (Table 1) suggests that each political language holds a special political power relationship between “the people’s relationship with the government” and “the government’s relationship with the people.” My contribution is to show that each element is independent and has been long defined as such, even though I am the first to reorganize the definitions of republicanism, authoritarianism, and liberalism for the purpose of creating political elements as independent variables.

I provide a way for social scientists to begin to craft empirically grounded models to observe the American political culture. The models are beyond the scope of this paper. Each element has a multitude of signals that do not relate or mix with the other elements (Appendix A). Thus, I provide a “first step” in procuring an empirically based model to analyze America’s political culture.
The signals to find expressions of authoritarianism are:

1. **The panopticon effect** (degrees on domination)
   A. State surveillance without people’s rights
   B. State is secretive about security
   C. State has power over the people, not people over state
   D. Nationalism to leader over patriotism to ideals
   E. Power / agency formations top-down creating ascriptive hierarchies

2. **Violations of civil liberties** (abandoning protection from government)
   A. Authoritarians dictate rights and take them away, at will
   B. Widespread governmental corruption of polity / society
      a. denial of habeas corpus
      b. denial of right to remain silent
      c. denial of a lawyer with defense rights
      d. denial to a speedy and fair trial
      e. government engages search and seizure without probable cause
      f. people arrested for publicly peacefully protesting
      g. freedom of religion denied to people
The signals to find expressions of authoritarianism are:

3. **Violations of civil rights** (abandoning protection for all to participate equally in the polity and society)
   - A. ascriptive hierarchy present
   - B. weighted voting for winners
   - C. exclusion of voters from politics
   - D. one party rule
   - E. non-party members excluded from political / social life
   - F. eliminate liberal neutrality
   - G. eliminate republican “worthwhile opportunity” (Geise 1984)

4. **Stationary Ruler** (degrees on authoritarian rule)
   - A. Non-democracy
   - B. Prefers exploitation / cabal in economic / political systems
   - C. Society exhibits high levels of fear
     - a. of government
     - b. of other people in society
   - D. congruence between authoritarian people and authoritarian Government
   - E. Authoritarians fight against exogenous political languages
The signals to find expressions of liberalism are:

5. **Advancement of liberal values** (e.g., Brettschneider, 2012)
   A. Liberal neutrality (all types of speech activity protected)
   B. Value society (promote core democratic values)
   C. Imposing Liberalism (coercion for capitalism and democracy)

6. **Admonishment of illiberal values** (e.g., Brettschneider, 2012)
   A. Admonish hateful society
   B. Admonish invasive state
The signals to find expressions of liberalism are:

7. **Advancement of democracy**
   A. Towards full protections of civil rights.
   B. Towards full protections of civil liberties.
   C. National public opinion is part of politics
   D. Towards government transparency for the people
   E. Linkage and leverage (linking capitalism / democracy to more people)
   F. “Free and Fair” elections” Procedural democracy
      a. inter-party relations
      b. intra-party relations
      c. elections open to all citizens
      d. admonish voter suppression
      e. open campaigns
   G. Independent Courts
The signals to find expressions of liberalism are:

8. Advancement of capitalism (Free Trade)
   A. Bell curve distribution is ideal, but not necessary
   B. Efficient and robust middle class, but not necessary
   C. Conservatives understand inequality natural
   D. Progressives use capitalism to assist median voter
   E. Protections of capitalistic markets and workers / owners
The signals to find expressions of liberalism are:

9. **Hartz’s toolkit**
   A. Alger Myth (work hard and you will make the middle-class)
   B. American democrat (a belief in individual development via capitalism)
   C. Liberal enlightenment (enable the next, wiser, liberal regime)
   D. Charm and terror (make money, work hard, and success follows; if you fail then you are the failure and not the system)
   E. Hysteria after critical event (turning eccentricity into sin)
   F. Transcended liberalism, no hysteria after critical event
   G. Messianism (America is the greatest country of all time—the example)
   H. Whiggery (deny faith in democracy)
   I. Liberal imperialism (violence initiated against exogenous languages)
   J. Liberal absolutism (no violence against fellow liberals only)
The signals to find expressions of republicanism are:

10. **Enforce non-domination**
   A. Advocate efficacy and worthwhile activity
   B. Admonish vitiation, invigilation and intimidation
   C. Admonish liberal neutrality

11. **Local ideology** [not localist]
   A. Local associations are powerful
   B. Local government salient domestically
   C. People express opposition to policy directly (resolutions, petitions)
   D. Local people expect national government promotes republicanism in foreign policy—making rules to enable / incentivize local people
The signals to find expressions of republicanism are:

12. **Equitable civil rights**
   A. Not simply equal opportunity by law among citizens
   B. Promotes equal resources for all citizens

13. **Grassroots civil liberties**
   A. Protections not simply from government; but,
   B. Grassroots actively protects people from government and people.
14. **Worthwhile and Efficacious Economy**
   A. End rapacious capitalism
   B. Promote not-for-profits / fair trade
   C. Promote local government, education, small business partnerships
   D. Promote common pool resources when appropriate
   E. Promote benefit corporations

The signals to find expressions of republicanism are:
The signals to find expressions of republicanism are:

15. **Self-Government before Representative Democracy**
   A. Tracking citizen interests in voting
   B. Tracking citizen interests in tax returns
   C. Tracking public opinion is deliberative
      a. what you think knowing x,y,z information
      b. local government open to public opinion
      c. local government records and distributes public opinion
      d. public choice (move to preferred local government) salient
   D. Likely a multiparty system
   E. High levels of partisan debate / contention
   F. High levels of compromise for action
      a. low levels of single party dominance
   G. Measure of voter suppression based on equitable opportunity
   H. The right to instruct is demonstrated (the people instruct government on laws)
      a. petition, resolutions, ballot initiatives, referendums.
The End

John Girdwood